

1 HANSON BRIDGETT LLP
 KURT A. FRANKLIN, SBN 172715
 2 kfranklin@hansonbridgett.com
 LISA M. POOLEY, SBN 168737
 3 lpooley@hansonbridgett.com
 SAMANTHA WOLFF, SBN 240280
 4 swolff@hansonbridgett.com
 425 Market Street, 26th Floor
 5 San Francisco, California 94105
 Telephone: (415) 777-3200
 6 Facsimile: (415) 541-9366

7 HANSON BRIDGETT LLP
 TYSON M. SHOWER, SBN 190375
 8 tshower@hansonbridgett.com
 LONDON D. BAILEY, SBN 240236
 9 lbailey@hansonbridgett.com
 500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1500
 10 Sacramento, California 95814
 Telephone: (916) 442-3333
 11 Facsimile: (916) 442-2348

12 OTTEN LAW, PC
 VICTOR OTTEN, SBN 165800
 13 vic@ottenlawpc.com
 KAVITA TEKCHANDANI, SBN 234873
 14 kavita@ottenlawpc.com
 3620 Pacific Coast Highway, #100
 15 Torrance, California 90505
 Telephone: (310) 378-8533
 16 Facsimile: (310) 347-4225

17 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
 CORY SPENCER, DIANA MILENA
 18 REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION
 RANGERS, INC.
 19

20 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 21 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION**
 22

23 CORY SPENCER, an individual;
 24 DIANA MILENA REED, an
 individual; and COASTAL
 25 PROTECTION RANGERS, INC., a
 26 California non-profit public benefit
 corporation,
 27

28 Plaintiffs.

CASE NO. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)

**DECLARATION OF KURT A.
 FRANKLIN IN OPPOSITION TO
 DEFENDANTS CITY OF PALOS
 VERDES ESTATES AND CHIEF OF
 POLICE JEFF KEPLEY'S MOTION
 FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR, IN
 THE ALTERNATIVE, SUMMARY
 ADJUDICATION**

Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)

DECL. OF K. FRANKLIN IN OPP. TO DEFTS. CITY OF PALOS VERDES ESTATES AND CHIEF OF POLICE
 JEFF KEPLEY'S MOT. FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, SUMMARY ADJUD.

1
2 v.

3 LUNADA BAY BOYS; THE
4 INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS OF THE
5 LUNADA BAY BOYS, including but
6 not limited to SANG LEE, BRANT
7 BLAKEMAN, ALAN JOHNSTON
8 AKA JALIAN JOHNSTON,
9 MICHAEL RAE PAPAYANS,
10 ANGELO FERRARA, FRANK
11 FERRARA, CHARLIE FERRARA,
12 and N. F.; CITY OF PALOS VERDES
13 ESTATES; CHIEF OF POLICE JEFF
14 KEPLEY, in his representative
15 capacity; and DOES 1-10,
16
17 Defendants.

Judge: Hon. S. James Otero
Date: September 5, 2017
Time: 10:00 a.m.
Crtrm.: 10C

Complaint Filed: March 29, 2016
Trial Date: November 7, 2017

15 I, Kurt A. Franklin, declare as follows:

16 1. I am an attorney duly admitted to practice before this Court. I am a
17 partner with Hanson Bridgett LLP, attorneys of record for Plaintiffs CORY
18 SPENCER, DIANA MILENA REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION RANGERS,
19 INC. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein, except as to those
20 stated on information and belief and, as to those, I am informed and believe them to
21 be true. If called as a witness, I could and would competently testify to the matters
22 stated herein.

23 2. Attached hereto as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of select
24 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Steve Barber** taken in the instant action on
25 June 22, 2017.

26 3. Attached hereto as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of select
27 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Tony Best** (Person Most Knowledgeable for
28

1 Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates) taken in the instant action on July 21, 2017.

2 4. Attached hereto as Exhibit 3 is a true and correct copy of select
3 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Brant Blakeman** taken in the
4 instant action on November 21, 2016.

5 5. Attached hereto as Exhibit 4 is a true and correct copy of select
6 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Ken Claypool** taken in the instant action on
7 June 13, 2017.

8 6. Attached hereto as Exhibit 5 is a true and correct copy of select
9 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Anton Dahlerbruch** taken in the instant
10 action on November 18, 2016.

11 7. Attached hereto as Exhibit 6 is a true and correct copy of select
12 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Anton Dahlerbruch (Person Most**
13 **Knowledgeable for Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates)** taken in the instant
14 action on July 13, 2017.

15 8. Attached hereto as Exhibit 7 is a true and correct copy of select
16 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Charles Ferrara** taken in the
17 instant action on July 7, 2017.

18 9. Attached hereto as Exhibit 8 is a true and correct copy of select
19 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Defendant Chief of Police Jeff Kepley**
20 taken in the instant action on October 10, 2016.

21 10. Attached hereto as Exhibit 9 is a true and correct copy of select
22 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Sheri Repp Loadsman (Person Most**
23 **Knowledgeable for Defendant City of Palos Verdes Estates)** taken in the instant
24 action on July 13, 2017.

25 11. Attached hereto as Exhibit 10 is a true and correct copy of select
26 redacted excerpts of the deposition transcript of **N.F.** taken in the instant action on
27 July 6, 2017.

1 12. Attached hereto as Exhibit 11 is a true and correct copy of select
2 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Catherine Placek** taken in the instant action
3 on June 23, 2017.

4 13. Attached hereto as Exhibit 12 is a true and correct copy of select
5 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Plaintiff Diana Milena Reed** taken in the
6 instant action on October 24 and 25, 2016.

7 14. Attached hereto as Exhibit 13 is a true and correct copy of select
8 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Plaintiff Cory Spencer** taken in the instant
9 action on October 11, 2016.

10 15. Attached hereto as Exhibit 14 is a true and correct copy of select
11 excerpts of the deposition transcript of **Christopher Taloa** taken in the instant
12 action on January 5, 2017.

13 16. Exhibit 15 is a true and correct redacted copy of Defendant Alan
14 Johnston's Cell Record Detail. An unredacted copy of Exhibit 15 is submitted with
15 Plaintiffs' Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

16 17. Attached hereto as Exhibit 16 is a true and correct copy of the transcript
17 of the DVD of Swell Life of Browne and Peter McCollum. The DVD is being
18 lodged separately with the Court. I caused my office to transcribe statements made
19 by Peter McCollum in the documentary.

20 18. My co-counsel in this matter, Victor Otten, is lodging a true and correct
21 copy select video excerpts from the documentary The Swell Life (2001), Darren
22 McInerney, Director, which documents surfing localism. A true and correct copy of
23 this video, bates PLTF002249, is Exhibit 34 to this declaration and is lodged with
24 the court. *See* Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging. In particular, Plaintiffs are lodging
25 excerpts from the Swell Life video showing declarations against interest made by
26 Peter McCollum and Chief Timm Browne as identified more specifically in
27 Paragraphs 19 and 20.

1 19. Lunada Bay local Peter McCollum on video shown in the documentary
 2 (5:14 seconds to 5:31, and 15:05 to 15:19) Witness Geoffrey Hagins observed Mr.
 3 McCollum on this day, and authenticates the video excerpts accurately portray what
 4 happened that day. *See* Hagins Decl. ¶¶ 3, 6, and 7. Further, I caused my office to
 5 transcribe what Mr. McCollum says in the video, which is: "He won't surf here
 6 again, though, got it? Got it? You got that, son? You got it? Hey, hey, I'm touching
 7 nobody. Nothing. But you won't surf here again, boy. You won't surf here again.
 8 Fuck that, fuck you guys! I've been here too long to take this shit." (5:14 seconds to
 9 5:31). And, "How many guys are at Malibu right now, huh? How many fucking
 10 guys are at Malibu, huh? (I don't know.) Did you ever notice we've done a good
 11 thing here, haven't we? It's pretty nice and pretty, huh? (It's beautiful.) It's beautiful!
 12 And so when you exploit it, we'll thank you." (15:05 to 15:19).

13 20. Lunada Bay Chief of Police Timm Browne, is also depicted in the
 14 documentary. I caused my office to transcribe what Chief Browne says in the video,
 15 which is: "In 1995, there were some incidents actually provoked by outsiders who
 16 brought news crews with them. Umm, they had it planned and then provoked
 17 incidents that are actually captured on local television news spots. People here do
 18 not like outsiders in general. Umm, I mean, they pay a price to live here. Umm,
 19 they have beautiful views of the ocean from most of the homes in the City. Umm,
 20 so, uh, they are protective of their community as a whole, umm, I mean surfers or
 21 non-surfers." (13:44 to 14:39) And, "The people that live in and around that area and
 22 then surf there do not want pictures taken because it is a gem. They don't want
 23 people to know where it specifically it is. If everybody knows where it is, then we'll
 24 have all 8 million surfers from Los Angeles in that little tiny cove?" (14:37 to 15:04)
 25 During the deposition of Tony Best, I showed him this same video and he was able
 26 to confirm it was Timm Brown, whom he had worked under. *See* PAMF 163, and
 27 Best Depo. 124:22-25, 125:1-25, 126:1-25, 127:1-13.

28

1 21. From The Los Angeles Times Website, I downloaded the following
2 articles, true and correct copies of which are attached as Exhibits A and B to
3 Plaintiffs' Request for Judicial Notice, as specifically detailed in Paragraphs 22 and
4 23.

5 22. The Los Angeles Times, July 5, 1991, Tim Waters, "The Hazards of
6 Surfing Lunada Bay: Peninsula: Outsiders run the risk of being pelted with rocks or
7 having their vehicles vandalized. The locals offer no apologies for treating the
8 public area as if it was their own." This article is available online through The Los
9 Angeles Times website at: [http://articles.latimes.com/1991-07-05/local/me-](http://articles.latimes.com/1991-07-05/local/me-1657_1_lunada-bay)
10 [1657_1_lunada-bay](http://articles.latimes.com/1991-07-05/local/me-1657_1_lunada-bay);

11 23. The Los Angeles Times, May 8, 1995, Tony Perry, Turf Wars Spoil
12 Sanctity of Southland Surf Beaches : Violence: Popularity leads to crowding.
13 Charges that one group attacked outsiders highlight the problem." This article is
14 available online through The Los Angeles Times website at:
15 http://articles.latimes.com/1995-05-08/news/mn-63795_1_lunada-bay.

16 24. From Bureau of Justice Statistics, I downloaded a December 29, 2016
17 report by Todd D. Minton and Zhen Zeng, Ph.D. from the Bureau of Justice
18 Statistics entitled "Jail Inmates In 2015." This report is available online through the
19 Bureau of Justice Statistics website at:

20 <https://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=pbdetail&iid=5872> A true and correct copy of
21 this report is attached as Exhibits C to Plaintiffs' Request for Judicial Notice.

22 25. My co-counsel in this matter, Victor Otten, is lodging a true and correct
23 copy video taken by Defendant Brant Blakeman on February 13, 2016 [Bates No.
24 BB081 and BB082]. I have transcribed the audio from this video, a true and correct
25 copy of which is as attached as Exhibit 17, to this Declaration. *See* Plaintiffs' Notice
26 of Lodging.

27 26. News correspondent Frank Stoltze of AirTalk Radio Los Angeles,
28

1 KPCC 89.3, interviewed Defendant Chief of Police Jeff Kepley regarding localism
2 in Lunada Bay. The radio interview is titled "How surfer 'gang mentality' is keeping
3 people off some SoCal beaches," and dated July 17, 2015. The full radio interview
4 is available online through Southern California Public Radio (SCPR) at:
5 [http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-](http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-is-keeping-people-off-so/)
6 [is-keeping-people-off-so/](http://www.scpr.org/programs/airtalk/2015/07/17/43700/how-surfer-gang-mentality-is-keeping-people-off-so/). I have downloaded this radio interview for use in this
7 lawsuit. I caused my office to transcribe what Chief Kepley says in the radio
8 interview (2:57 through 7:40). Next, during the deposition of the City's PMK, Tony
9 Best, who has worked with Chief Kepley since Chief Kepley started as Chief for
10 City of Palos Verdes Estates, Captain Best authenticated it was Chief Kepley in the
11 radio interview. *See* PAMF 171, Best Depo. 149:5-11. A true and correct copy of
12 Mr. Stoltze's July 17, 2015 radio interview of Chief Jeff Kepley is attached as
13 Exhibit 18 to this declaration and is lodged with this Court by my co-counsel in this
14 matter, Victor Otten. *See* Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging.

15 27. After the filing of this lawsuit, CBS News produced a nationwide news
16 story on Lunada Bay, led by correspondent Carter Evans. My co-counsel Victor
17 Otten downloaded this story for use in this lawsuit, sharing it with my office. In the
18 Carter Evans' story, at timestamp 2:47, a Palos Verdes Estates Police Officer is seen
19 telling Mr. Evans and his crew: "We cannot send officers down there all the time,
20 you know? But if something happens, you have a cell phone, too?" During the
21 deposition of the City's PMK, Tony Best, who works with Sargent Luke Hellinga,
22 Captain Best verified it is Sergeant Hellinga who is making the statement to Mr.
23 Evans. A true and correct copy of this video, bates PLTF002251, is Exhibit 35 to
24 this declaration and is lodged with the Court by my co-counsel in this matter, Victor
25 Otten. *See* PAMF 171, Best Depo. 140:9-25, 141:1-3; *see also* Plaintiffs' Notice of
26 Lodging.

1 28. My co-counsel Victor Otten obtained video of Officer Aaron Belda
2 interacting with an event participant at Coastal Protection Rangers' 2017 Martin
3 Luther King Jr., whom was intending to file a complaint about violation of the local
4 surfing ordinance. In it, Officer Belda tells the event participant: "I'm not a surfer,
5 so I don't understand surfing etiquette. And I don't even know what dropping in is."
6 A true and correct copy of this video, bates PLTF002250, is Exhibit 36 to this
7 declaration and is lodged with the Court. *See* PAMF 187, Best Depo. 130:23-25,
8 131:1-3, 131:18-24; *see also* Plaintiffs' Notice of Lodging.

9 29. Attached hereto as Exhibit 19 is a true and correct copy of the Palos
10 Verdes Estates Police Department Investigation Narrative (City Doc. 152).

11 30. Attached hereto as Exhibit 20 is a true and correct copy of the Palos
12 Verdes Estates Police Department Office Report for Incident 16-00720 (City
13 Doc. 185-187).

14 31. Attached hereto as Exhibit 21 is a true and correct copy of the
15 [REDACTED] marked
16 "CONFIDENTIAL" (City Bates. Nos. CITY7087-CITY7096). *See also* Plaintiffs'
17 Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

18 32. In reference to paragraph 21 above, on Thursday, July 27, 2017, with
19 my partner Samantha Wolff, we called attorney Jacob Song who represents the City
20 of Palos Verdes Estates, asking to meet and confer over our request that City
21 document Nos. CITY7087-CITY7096 not be marked "CONFIDENTIAL" as we
22 intended to use this in our opposition to the City's Motion for Summary Judgment
23 and we did not believe it was properly marked. This Document is titled [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED] and is an external
25 investigation of the planned-but-cancelled "compromised" investigation identified in
26 the City's SSUF 82, which was set to take place on February 13, 2016 but "leaked"
27 the day before. In it, a resident (and Bay Boy) is identified as persuading the City
28

1 Manager to cancel the investigation the very next day. And it identifies potential
 2 internal and external sources of the "leak." Because the City's attorney did not get
 3 back to us, we are submitting this document in conjunction with an Application for
 4 Leave to File Documents Under Seal, consistent with the parties' stipulated
 5 protective order. Plaintiffs do not believe the City has properly marked this
 6 "CONFIDENTIAL" and ask that this document be made public. *See also* Plaintiffs'
 7 Application for Leave to File Under Seal.

8 33. Attached hereto as Exhibit 22 is a true and correct copy of the City of
 9 Palos Verdes Estates and Chief of Police Jeff Kepley's Responses in Opposition to
 10 the Separate Statement of Undisputed [sic] Facts In Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for
 11 Class Certification [Docket No. 189].

12 34. Attached hereto as Exhibit 23 is a true and correct copy of the
 13 Declaration of Mark Slatten in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification
 14 [Docket No. 159-6].

15 35. Attached hereto as Exhibit 24 is a true and correct copy of the
 16 Declaration of Diana Milena Reed in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class
 17 Certification [Docket No. 159-5].

18 36. Attached hereto as Exhibit 25 is a true and correct copy of the
 19 Declaration of Cory Spencer in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification
 20 [Docket No. 159-4].

21 37. Attached hereto as Exhibit 26 is a true and correct copy of the Expert
 22 Declaration of Peter Neushul in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification
 23 [Docket No. 184-1].

24 38. Attached hereto as Exhibit 27 is a true and correct copy of the
 25 Declaration of Amin Akhavan in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class
 26 Certification [Docket No. 171].

27 39. Attached hereto as Exhibit 28 is a true and correct copy of the
 28

1 Declaration of Christopher Taloa in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class
2 Certification [Docket No. 159-10].

3 40. Attached hereto as Exhibit 29 is a true and correct copy of the
4 Declaration of Jordan Wright Spencer [sic] in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class
5 Certification [Docket No. 159-9].

6 41. Attached hereto as Exhibit 30 is a true and correct copy of the
7 Declaration of Ricardo G. Pastor in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Class
8 Certification [Docket No. 175].

9 42. Attached hereto as Exhibit 31 is a true and correct copy of the
10 Declaration of Philip King in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification
11 [Docket No. 184-2].

12 43. Attached hereto as Exhibit 32 is a true and correct copy of the
13 Declaration of Philip King in Support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants City of
14 Palos Verdes Estates and Chief of Police Jeff Kepley's Motion to Strike the
15 Declaration of Philip King [Docket No. 216-1].

16 44. Attached hereto as Exhibit 33 is a true and correct copy of Defendant
17 City of Palos Verdes Estates' Responses to Interrogatories Set One Propounded by
18 Plaintiff Cory Spencer.

19
20 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of
21 America that the foregoing is true and correct.

22 Executed on this 31st day of July, 2017, at San Francisco, California.

23
24 /s/ Kurt A. Franklin
25 Kurt A. Franklin
26
27
28